

# Greenpeace's role in pressuring the india government to overcome air pollution 2015-2018

*Deliani Azmi Zakiah Ahmad*\*, Sugito, *Muhammad* Hanif Imaduddin

International Program of International Relations, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Indonesia, 55183

**Abstract.** This study aims to explain the strategies of Greenpeace in pressuring the Indian government to overcome air pollution immediately that occurred in the country in 2015-2018. Based on WHO reports, India is known to be one of the countries with very high levels of air pollution in the world. Air pollution is a significant environmental problem in India and has caused various health problems to the death of its people. Greenpeace as an international organization whose aim is to protect the environment strives to help people express their aspirations to the government to immediately take proper actions related to air pollution in the country in various ways, such as campaigns and protest actions. Using the concept of NGO to look at Greenpeace's way of inviting the public to get involved in its activities, then using the concept of the Transnational Advocacy Network to find out Greenpeace's strategy in suppressing the Indian government.

## 1 Introduction

Greenpeace is an international non-governmental organization that often criticizes governments or corporations for not caring about environmental problems and animal life in the wild. In carrying out these actions, Greenpeace mostly advocates through campaigns which include videos or hashtags which they disseminate through social media. The campaign was chosen by Greenpeace because it is a fairly effective method in accommodating environmental problems. Greenpeace has spread globally focusing on different kinds of environmental issues happen in different countries [1]. One of which is India amid the neoliberal globalization era, facing a serious level of air pollution which contribute to the climate change and environmental crisis and may harm the humankind in the long term[2].

According to the 2019 State of Global Air (SOGA) report released by the Health Effect Institute, air pollution contributed to one in ten deaths in 2017 and has made it a greater cause of death than malaria and road accidents [3]. In 2014, the World Health Organization (WHO) issued a report that included ratings of approximately 1,600 cities in 91 countries for their air quality as measured by concentrations of PM10 and PM2.5. These particles are very dangerous and will stick to the lungs and can cause various diseases.

---

\* Corresponding author: [deliani.azmi.2016@fisipol.umy.ac.id](mailto:deliani.azmi.2016@fisipol.umy.ac.id)

In the report issued by the WHO explained that 13 of the 20 most polluted cities are in India. Delhi, the capital of India, is ranked first as the most polluted city in the world with an annual average of 153 kilograms of PM<sub>2.5</sub> per cubic meter. Of course this is not a proud achievement for the country [4]. As for the factors that cause pollution in Delhi to be very severe, including heavy traffic, large landfills and sometimes the waste is burned, coal-fired power plants, and smoke from burning crops in agricultural fields that appears during the rainy season. Anumita Choudhury, a representative of a Delhi-based thinktank group called the Center for Science and Environment (CSE), said that private vehicle use in Delhi between 1991 and 2011 increased to 8 million vehicles while the Indian government paid little attention to public transport due to a shortage of investors. . Environmentalists say that 40-50% of PM 2.5 particles in Delhi are caused by vehicles [5].

According to a report released by The Lancet Commission on Pollution and Health, in 2015 about 2.5 million Indians died from air pollution. Exposure to high air pollution that occurs for years can affect the human respiratory system and inflammation which will then lead to several diseases, such as heart disease, stroke, to lung cancer [6]. The most vulnerable to the effects of air pollution are children and the elderly. Children who are exposed to polluted air will experience inhibition of lung development throughout their lives. While elderly people who are over 50 years old have a higher risk of death if exposed to dirty air where nine out of ten elderly people die from air pollution [3].

Earlier in 2015, the Indian government through Prime Minister Narendra Modi issued the first National Air Quality Index (NAQI) to provide real time information on pollution levels in the country [7]. Greenpeace then conducted a search on the NAQI and found that the previous government's index was limited, lacked transparency, and was not designed to make air quality data widely available or useful to citizens [7]. In addition, Greenpeace also found discrepancies in investment and infrastructure where only Delhi has 103 continuous monitoring stations, while in other areas there are only one to three monitoring stations [8]. From these searches, Greenpeace found that the Indian government has not been too serious in dealing with the problem of air pollution that has hit the country. This is what then makes Greenpeace determined to show itself as an environmental organization that really cares about environmental problems around it. Therefore, Greenpeace then carried out a series of actions through a campaign to pressure the Indian government to immediately address the air pollution that occurred in the country.

## **2 Theoretical Framework**

### **2.1 Non-Governmental Organizations**

In international relations, the state is not the only actor involved, there are other actors who also play a role in international politics, one of which is non-governmental organizations or NGOs (Non-Governmental Organizations). David Lewis in his book entitled *The Management of Non-Governmental Development Organizations* describes NGOs as a "voluntary association" that has a concern for changing a certain environment in a better context [9]. NGOs also have the function of controlling, facilitating and partnering with the government and advocating for socio-political and development issues. But basically, NGOs are formed by a group of people who have common interests, perform various services and humanitarian functions, convey people's aspirations to the government, and monitor policies and encourage political participation at the community level [10]. Based on their activities, Philip Eldridge classifies NGOs into two types, namely:

- a. Development NGO, this type focuses more on conventional community development programs, such as irrigation, drinking water, agriculture, animal husbandry, health centers, and economic development;

- b. Mobilization NGOs, this type focuses on mobilizing the poor on issues of ecology, education, human rights, women's status, legal rights in land ownership status, traders' rights, and the homeless.

The emergence of NGOs and the positions they hold have contributed to changing the relationship between the state and society. The presence of NGOs has increased interest in the development of democracy in the international world where the people themselves are not too interested in traditional representative democracy. From this, the community then tries to convey their aspirations through non-profit institutions such as NGOs, so that the role of NGOs is even greater in decision making in a country [11]. Then based on its relationship with the state, Philip Eldridge classifies NGOs as follows:

- a. High Level Partnership: Grassroots Development, which is a type that is characterized by a very participatory relationship and prioritizes activities related to development. In addition, this species also has less interest in political matters, but has considerable attention in influencing government policies by always maintaining support at the grassroots level;
- b. High Level Politics: Grassroot Mobilization, this type is more likely to only be active in political activities and generally is advocate, especially in supporting the increase of political awareness at the community level;
- c. Empowerment at the Grassroot, this type focuses more on empowering the community at the grassroots level and does not have the desire to make contact with the government.

This type generally also does not want to be involved in large-scale activities [12].

Just like an organization in general, NGOs also have their own organizational structure, decision making, and funding. Usually each NGO has its own way of working which is also based on the foundations of the formation of the NGO. However, in terms of funding, most NGOs manage it independently through donations from members and donors. Donations were made because NGOs were formed independently without any funding from certain parties, such as the government and companies [11].

## **2.2 Transnational Advocacy Networks**

In this study, the author uses the concept of the Transnational Advocacy Networks (TAN) or the National Advocacy Network by Keck & Sikkink. Advocacy networks are a form of cooperative relationship that has the characteristics of being voluntary, reciprocal, parallel, and bound by shared values in the exchange of communication within the network [13]. The network has transnational, regional, and domestic significance, and involves experts, scientists and activists. In addition, TAN has a role as a driver of regional and international integration processes by building relationships between actors, namely civil society, government or state, and international organizations. The purpose of TAN is as a strategic group effort to increase mutual awareness in the world through legitimate collective action [14]. Within the framework there are ideas, norms, and discourses in the debate so as to present information or testimony. In addition to promoting norms, TAN is also used as a pressure for other actors to adopt policies and monitor compliance with predetermined regional and international standards [15].

Transnational networks seek influence in much the same way that political groups or other social movements do, but because they are not very powerful they must use the power of their information, ideas, and strategies to change the information and value contexts in which states make policy. In order for TAN to run well, Keck & Sikkink suggested four strategies that can be used so as to be able to achieve the goals of the movement, including the following:

- a. Information politics, namely the ability possessed by network members to transfer information that can be used politically quickly and credible to move their targets to be influenced and change their policies;
- b. Symbolic politics, namely the ability to use certain symbols or signs, actions and stories that can attract the attention of the audience or parties whose positions are far away;
- c. Leverage politics or political ability to influence by gathering actors who have the power to influence so as to strengthen the movement of network members;
- d. Accountable politics is an effort made by network members and actors by maintaining and supervising the government to maintain and be consistent with the policies and principles that have been made previously and in accordance with their goals.

### **3 Research Method**

In this study, the author uses a descriptive-analytical type of research, which is a method that describes a problem or case that is presented based on existing facts based on specific facts and then researched to solve the problem and draw general conclusions. The author uses data collection techniques using secondary data obtained from literature studies using related books and journals and other written media as well as electronic sources, such as journals and news both nationally and internationally.

## **4 Result and Discussion**

### **4.1 Greenpeace Strategy to Pressure the India Government**

In this chapter, the author will explain the strategies used by Greenpeace in pressuring the Indian government to deal with air pollution cases in their country. The strategies adopted by Greenpeace are as follows:

#### **4.1.1 Information Politics**

In this case, Greenpeace uses an information politics strategy where Greenpeace tries to use the information they have to invite the public and other actors to join and participate in the activities they create, namely the Clean Air Nation campaign. Greenpeace uses their official website to publish and disseminate the information they get to their audience. The information they usually publish includes articles, reports, or posters for calls to action and petitions.

In 2016, Greenpeace also released a report entitled *Out of Sight* which identified several polluting places in India associated with coal-fired power plants [16]. According to a report released by Greenpeace, more than 300 coal-fired power plants in India still violate the emission standards provided by the Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change (MoEFCC) in 2015. The new MoEFCC norm is to limit particulate (PM), sulfur emissions, dioxide, nitrogen oxides, mercury, and reduced water use by coal-fired power plants. The emission level has increased by about 32% in the last 5 years in India. The Indian government was given two years until 7 December 2017 to implement the new MoEFCC norms, but the government through the Ministry of Electricity, Central Electricity Authority, and the electric power industry are trying to implement the norms in the next 5-7 years, namely in 2022 -2024 [17].

Greenpeace's uniquely packaged protests, such as climbing the Vashi bridge in Mumbai, can also trigger media coverage, both print and electronic. This is used by Greenpeace as a strategy to mobilize the community. Greenpeace itself acts as a mobilization structure. In the book *Globalization and Cross-Border Labor Solidarity in the Americas: The Anti-Sweatshop Movement and the Struggle for Social Justice* written by Ralph Armbruster-Sandoval, defines mobilization structures as collective vehicles, both formal and informal, to mobilize people to engage in collective action. This mobilization structure aims to disseminate information in order to encourage the community to get involved in collective action, in this case the Clean Air Nation campaign that has been created by Greenpeace. Information politics used by Greenpeace such as reports, articles, posters, petitions, campaigns, and protests is the basis of the mobilization process carried out by Greenpeace.

Greenpeace itself is a Mobilization NGO, namely an NGO that focuses its activities on community mobilization related to several issues, one of which is ecological or environmental issues. Mobilization within Greenpeace itself is better known as people power which seeks to put the community at the center to trigger campaigns and encourage more people to get involved in it. The chances of winning will be greater if the campaign is carried out by many people [18]. Greenpeace's ability to mobilize the community allows for the dissemination of information about the campaign and their actions more broadly, thus being able to invite more people to get involved in it. The more people who get involved and participate in it, the more likely they will get attention from the parties they are targeting, such as the media and the government. The media itself plays a very important role in the process of disseminating information owned by Greenpeace. Every protest action and campaign carried out by Greenpeace always gets media attention, so the media will then make news about the actions carried out by Greenpeace in the articles they make.

Social media also has a very important role in the process of disseminating Greenpeace information to the public in general and the government in particular. Social media platforms, such as Youtube, Twitter, and Facebook are platforms that Greenpeace uses quite often in conveying its information. But among the three, Greenpeace uses Twitter more often where they can publish their opinions and actions related to the Clean Air Nation campaign. They used the hashtag #cleanairnation on Twitter to mobilize the community regarding their campaign. In addition, the hashtag can also help people to find information related to air pollution in India. On the Youtube platform itself, Greenpeace usually uploads videos about their campaigns. But they also upload other videos, such as video tutorials using the Clean Air Application application.

#### *4.1.2 Symbolic Politics*

The second strategy that Greenpeace uses is symbolic politics, where they formed a campaign activity called "Clean Air Nation" on September 22, 2015. The campaign aims to urge the government to immediately make improvements to NAQI and tackle air pollution effectively. One of Greenpeace India's campaigners, Nandikesh Sivalingam said that the Clean Air Nation campaign was an initiative to show the power of the people in reclaiming their right to clean air. Greenpeace also states that the NAQI issued by the government is not specifically designed to provide broad and useful air quality data to the public. According to Greenpeace, the NAQI can be a very useful tool if applied properly.

Greenpeace is not alone in running this campaign. Since December 2015, Greenpeace has collaborated with several community group organizations and formed a large group called #HelpDelhiBreathe. This group then carried out their first protest on January 17, 2016 which was held in Jantar Mantar, Delhi. by wearing anti-pollution masks and waving banners with slogans, such as "Delhi's dirty air. Not so fair" [19]. The rally was attended by experts in air pollution representing their organizations, such as Anumita Roychowdhury

from CSE, Sunil Dahiya from Greenpeace, Vikrant Tongad from SAFE and Parthaa Bosu from Clean Air Asia. One of Greenpeace's representatives, Sunil Dahiya, at the rally gave a speech that only a small part of the air quality monitoring stations in Delhi were functioning. He also added that Indians should start to abandon their habit of using vehicles and switch to walking. Vikrant Tongad also added that the air pollution that occurs will not disappear if the use of biomass fuels, especially in Punjab and Haryana, is still carried out [20].

In addition, Greenpeace also launched a Clean Air Application on the Google Play Store which aims to let users or the public know the quality of the air they breathe. In addition, this application also provides ways to anticipate yourself on a day when pollution is very bad and what actions the government should take to protect public health [8]. Greenpeace has also uploaded the procedure for using the application on Greenpeace India's Youtube platform on March 14, 2016, but unfortunately the comments column on the video was deactivated. The video has now been viewed by 963 times. On Greenpeace's Facebook page, they also uploaded the same video on April 13, 2016. The video has been viewed 322 times, shared 11 times, and received a comment from an Indian fanpage called Beautiful India which responded positively to the application. It can be seen that the public response to the application is quite good and can attract the attention of a small part of the Indian community.

On 7 December 2017, Greenpeace again protested with #HelpDelhiBreathe, activists, and other communities outside the MoeFCC building. The action was aimed at reminding MoeFCC ministers of the deadline that would expire at midnight that day. They urged MoeFCC to implement the new MoeFCC norms related to emission reductions issued by coal-fired power plants. Earlier in June 2017, Greenpeace had sent a letter to MoeFCC to immediately release an interim report on the "status of implementation" to dispel rumors about MoEFCC norms being unfulfilled. More than 63 people consisting of civil society, medical professionals and other civil society[17].

Coal-fired power plants in India have been shut down by the Indian government several times due to air pollution problems, for example the power plant in Bardapur. India itself is the third largest coal producer and consumer in the world and its total production can reach 650 million tons per year [21]. So don't be surprised if coal is a big enough contributor to air pollution. However, the government also cannot shut down the power plant forever even though Greenpeace or other parties have strongly stated that it is the main source of air pollution in India. If the government immediately closes the coal industry or power plant in their country, then the government is tantamount to closing jobs for some of the people. This will then create a level of high wine and will have an impact on reducing foreign exchange generated from coal. Therefore, the coal industry and power plants are not too bothered by the campaign carried out by Greenpeace because they feel that what they are doing is very important for their country. The government itself in this case does not ignore the pollution problems that occur in their country, but they also have to think about the consequences if the coal-fired industry and power plants are closed completely. Therefore, in the new MoeFCC norms, the government insists on coal-fired power plants to reduce the particulate emissions emitted by them so that it will help in the process of tackling air pollution in India.

Greenpeace's actions did not end there. On March 20, 2018, Greenpeace again held their protest at the Vashi Bridge, Mumbai, India. Seven Greenpeace activists climbed the bridge and put up a 60-foot banner that read, "Mumbai Clean Air Now!". The Vashi Bridge was chosen because of the thousands of vehicles that pass through it every day as a symbol of the impact of vehicle emissions on air quality in India. On the same day, Greenpeace and other environmental activists staged a protest outside the Bardapur Power Station in Delhi, India, which has been closed several times due to pollution concerns and has become a

symbol of the fight against air pollution. This action aims to remind the MoEFCC to immediately implement the National Clean Air Program as a public program and the right plan to achieve a 35% emission reduction in three years in the public sphere. The protests in the two major Indian cities were held to mark solidarity and unite people from various backgrounds in the fight against air pollution [22].

In addition to protesting, Greenpeace also often conducts online campaigns by using the internet and social media, which are now becoming easier. Greenpeace launched the online petition on the same day that it announced its Clean Air Nation campaign, which was on 22 September 2015. On their Twitter account, Greenpeace India stated that around 37,000 people had signed the petition in less than three months after its release. Greenpeace also uses the hashtag #cleanairnation on Twitter in each of their posts related to the Clean Air Nation campaign. This makes it easier for Greenpeace to invite or mobilize people from all professions to get involved in it. But unfortunately, the response given by his followers to every post on Twitter Greenpeace India is not commensurate with the number of followers it has. Even though Greenpeace India has tens of thousands of followers on Twitter, the average response they get for each post never hits 100 likes or retweets. It can be concluded that, Greenpeace's activities on social media did not have a significant impact on their campaigns.

The effectiveness of the symbolic politics strategy, in the form of campaigns and protests, was the announcement of the National Clean Air Program (NCAP) by the MoEFCC on 18 December 2017 in the Rajya Sabha as a step to tackle air pollution in India. The government through the MoEFCC is committed to making NCAP a long-term national-level strategy to comprehensively address rising air pollution across the country. According to Greenpeace, if the program has a specific time target for reducing pollutants to a certain percentage, then a comprehensive strategy to address all sources of air pollution is essential. In addition, there is also a need for an effective air quality monitoring network system that can help monitor the progress of action plans and provide real-time data to people [23].

The campaigns and protests that have been carried out by Greenpeace for approximately three years have come to light. Greenpeace is able to use the symbols they use, such as campaigns and protests, to take the issue of air pollution to a higher level. Greenpeace's efforts have finally received national attention, both from the community and the government. The amount of attention and support given to the Greenpeace campaign then indirectly urged the government to take immediate action as a policy maker in overcoming the issues brought by Greenpeace.

#### *4.1.3 Leverage Politics*

Furthermore, Greenpeace uses a strategy of leverage politics where Greenpeace tries to invite other influential actors to get involved in their campaign. To increase the power of their leverage politics strategy, Greenpeace create a network of cooperation with several other organizations and community groups in their campaigns. This collaboration has been started since December 2015, to be precise a few months after Greenpeace launched the Clean Air Nation campaign. Greenpeace invites these organizations and community groups because they share the same goal, namely to go to India with clean air. Greenpeace and some of these community groups then formed a large group called #HelpDelhiBreathe.

The organizations or community groups involved are the Center for Science and Environment, Clean Air Asia, The Energy and Resources Institutes (TERI), entrepreneurs, a group of housewives called #MyRightToBreathe, and foreign nationals living in India. #MyRightToBreathe itself has a pretty strong influence as a community group. This organization is made up of housewives who share a common concern for the health of their

children due to air pollution. These mothers can help by building a network by sharing messages or posting on Facebook, attending events, and also mobilizing other housewives. In addition, #HelpDelhiBreathe also borrowed the name #MyRightToBreathe as one of the main hashtags they will use on social media. The online campaign itself is one of the most powerful ways and becomes a meeting point for mothers, students, activists, and other communities who want to be involved in the action [19].

Greenpeace plays a significant role in #HelpDelhiBreathe. Greenpeace plays a role in gathering data and being the group's spokesperson for the media, particularly on the science and health impacts of air pollution. Greenpeace often presents the data they get to the media in order to attract the attention of the government. In addition, Greenpeace also often compares the air quality in India with China in the media to attract public attention because no Indian community wants to be compared negatively with China [19].

Previously on December 18 2017, the government through the MoEFCC announced that it was preparing NCAP as a measure to tackle air pollution. However, NCAP actually experienced a delay in the release so that the government would take longer to deal with air pollution in their country. This prompted Greenpeace to lobby the Minister of the Environment on March 23, 2018. Greenpeace said that its meeting with the Minister of the Environment was to convey the concerns of all Indians about the air pollution crisis in their country. Greenpeace also urges the Minister of Environment to immediately release the NCAP according to a clear schedule and plan.

Greenpeace India representatives have also lobbied and met with MPs and urged them to contact Dr. Harsh Vardhan, Minister of the Environment at the time. Greenpeace hopes that the release of NCAP will not be further delayed and the program will have clear transparency. Earlier on March 8 2018, the MoEFCC convinced the Supreme Court to settle the NCAP within four weeks. However, four weeks have passed and there has been no formal communication from the Ministry of Agriculture regarding further NCAP notification. Therefore, as many as 18 MPs from various parties together then wrote a letter to Dr. Harsh Vardhan to issue further notification regarding NCAP. Ten of them are from Lok Sabha (House of People) and the remaining eight are from Rajya Sabha (Council of State) [24]. Despite the delays, the government finally released the NCAP on January 10, 2019 as a strategy to tackle air pollution in India. NCAP is a five-year plan starting in 2019 with the main goal of reducing 20-30% concentrations of PM 2.5 and PM10 by 2024.

Thanks to its mobilizing power, Greenpeace was able to lobby and invite other, more influential actors to be involved in the campaign they created. In this regard, Greenpeace has succeeded in bringing together several organizations and community groups who share the same goals and concerns regarding air pollution in India. Greenpeace has also successfully lobbied the Minister of Environment and several members of parliament to immediately provide assurance that the release of NCAP will be in accordance with a clear plan and schedule.

## **4.2 Government Actions in Overcoming Air Pollution**

The previous government had clearly been trying to tackle the air pollution that occurred in the country. Through the Central Pollution Control Board (CPCB), the government formulated a Graded Response Action Plan (GRAP) in July 2016. Steps that can be taken under the GRAP include a comprehensive action plan by the MoEFCC, strict supervision of coal-fired power plants, and ban on petroleum coke (petcoke). /coke) in Delhi and NCR, Control Room upgrade The center at CPCB, augmentation of air quality monitoring stations in Delhi and NCR, launched the SAMEER mobile application for complaint recovery, as well as regular monitoring and directives by the Minister and Secretary of the MoEFCC. In addition CPCB has also provided a set of 42 action points to improve air



quality to all non-attainment cities. As a follow-up, 94 cities were asked to prepare detailed action plans to improve air quality based on the conditions of their respective cities. CPCB also held seven workshops in various locations to introduce and disseminate the guidelines for the action plan. Furthermore, out of 94 non-attainment cities, action plans for 61 cities have been accepted and the respective states have been asked to direct the implementation of the action plans in these cities.

In addition, the government in October 2016 also issued an application called *Hawa Badlo*. This application aims for the inclusive participation of citizens in reporting burning arson, dust from buildings, and dust from highways. One of the EPCA members, Said Narain said the application acts as an accountability, public information dissemination, and public engagement mechanism. Apps designed by EPCA and companies from Delhi, Haryana and Uttar Pradesh are now available on iOS and Android app stores [25]. But basically, this application also has problems and shortcomings, so people don't really feel that this application is quite effective. Although the plans or policies that have been issued by the government appear to be concrete and good steps, it seems that there is still a lack of coordination from every part of the government to cooperate in implementing the plan, so that it cannot be implemented properly and makes the public confused.

After two years of facing unrelenting public demands for a comprehensive national action plan to tackle air pollution, the government finally announced that it had formulated a National Clean Air Program (NCAP) to tackle air pollution on December 18, 2017. NCAP itself is a national strategy. Medium term used as a measure by the Indian government to tackle air pollution comprehensively. The goal of NCAP is to add and develop an effective network of ambient air quality monitoring throughout the country in addition to ensuring a comprehensive management plan for the prevention, control and reduction of air pollution. NCAP focuses on a collaborative and participatory approach comprising all sources of pollution and coordination between relevant Central Ministries, State Governments, local agencies and other stakeholders.

The framework of the NCAP plan has the following aspects:

- a. Discussions among the MoEFCC signaled a target of reducing air pollution by 35% in three years and a reduction of 50% in the next five years for at least 100 cities across India.
- b. The framework emphasizes increasing manual monitoring stations from 684 to 1000 stations across the country with CAAQMS to 268 from the previous 84.
- c. Improve PM<sub>2.5</sub> monitoring infrastructure from 67 stations to all NAMP stations (the proposed number is 1000).
- d. Deal with pollution from multiple sources across the country, identifying the electricity, transportation, industrial, housing, agricultural and regional pollution backgrounds between cities.
- e. Public dissemination of data, inclusive public participation on planning and implementation for NCAP.
- f. Established an Air Information Center for data analysis, interpretation, and dissemination including a GIS platform.
- g. Plan the Air Quality Forecasting System as a sophisticated modeling system that can estimate the air quality of the next day.
- h. Establish an updated national emissions inventory.

Sunil Dahiya, senior campaigner for Greenpeace India, said that the NCAP formulation released by the government is a very good thing to see the government's concentration increase on air pollution. However, there is a lack of clarity in planning where there is a lack of information on the public domain about NCAP, there must be transparency of information in the public domain and inclusive public transparency starting from the planning level. Concept notes on NCAP that are not available in the public domain raise

concerns about how the government will make NCAP a truly participatory initiative. According to him, it is very important that all discussions and documents related to NCAP are available in the public domain and the public is informed about the planning, implementation and progress that has been made through press briefings and other channels [26].

However, in reality, NCAP experience delays such as the adoption of the new MoEFCC norms. On 8 March 2018, the MoEFCC assured the Supreme Court that the NCAP would be completed within four weeks. However, until the end of March 2018, the government had not provided further information regarding the news from the NCAP which would be released if it was scheduled in April 2018. This prompted Greenpeace to meet with the Minister of Environment urging him to launch the NCAP according to a clear schedule and time. However, until April, the government still has not provided any confirmation. This also prompted Greenpeace to ask several members of parliament to urge the MoEFCC to immediately provide clarity on the NCAP. Around 18 MPs have sent a letter to the Minister of the Environment, Dr. Harsh Vardhan, who urged the MoEFCC to immediately release the NCAP as a measure to tackle air pollution. In their letter, the MPs also asked the government to ensure inclusive public participation, availability of information on platforms or the public domain, and transparency in NCAP. According to them, the NCAP targets to reduce emissions by 35% and 50% in five years are very good, but they are also concerned about whether these targets can be achieved given the delayed release of the program [22].

On April 17 2018, MoEFCC finally uploaded a draft or Concept Note from NCAP on the official NCAP website so that the general public can provide comments and input regarding the program. However, the draft can only be commented on publicly until 17 May 2018. Greenpeace and more than 50 community groups who are members of the Clean Air Collective held consultations and public discussions regarding NCAP on 9 May in Delhi. As a result, they recommended 20 points that must be considered by the government to strengthen NCAP and submitted them in the comments column on the NCAP website on May 17, 2018. One of the main recommendations from the Clean Air Collective is regarding the language contained in the draft note which only uses one language, namely English. According to them, it is not possible for everyone affected by pollution to understand and give their comments. Therefore, NCAP must at least have an additional language option, namely the language used by the wider community or into the regional language [24].

But in reality, NCAP is still experiencing delays in its release. Previously the MoEFCC planned to release the NCAP on World Environment Day on 5 June 2018. The MoEFCC had also stated that the NCAP would be released on 15 August 2018 on India's Independence Day, but in fact it was not released until October 2018. A senior official was of the opinion that the MoEFCC would release the NCAP before 2 December before the Minister of the Environment attends COP24 in Katowice, Poland. But in fact, the Minister of Environment told the Times of India newspaper that the NCAP is likely to be released on 20 December 2018.

The government through MoEFCC finally launched NCAP on 10 January 2019 as a time-bound national level strategy to tackle air pollution in India. The NCAP will be a medium-term five-year action plan with 2019 as its first year. The main objective of the program is a 20-30% reduction in PM<sub>2.5</sub> and PM<sub>10</sub> concentrations by 2024. The program will take 2017 as the base year for comparison of concentrations. The program can then be expanded for a longer period after the mid-term review results are completed. Specific action plans for the 102 non-attainment cities identified to implement mitigation actions under the NCAP and there will be a project monitoring committee at the state level with scientists and trained personnel. In addition, sectoral working groups, national-level Project

Monitoring Units, Project Implementation Units, state-level project monitoring units, city-level review committees under the City Commissioner and DM-level Committees in districts should be established under NCAP for effective implementation and program success. Other features of the NCAP are increasing the number of monitoring stations to 700 to 1000 stations across India including rural monitoring stations, technology support, emphasis on awareness and capacity building initiatives, setting up certification bodies for monitoring equipment, source sharing studies, emphasis on law enforcement, and sector-specific interventions [27]. NCAP is expected to be a tool or policy as a form of the Indian government's efforts to deal with air pollution effectively.

## 5 Conclusion

Greenpeace is an international organization that focuses on environmental issues that often criticizes governments or companies that are deemed not to be care and do damage to the surrounding environment. Greenpeace can be categorized as a Mobilization NGO because it focuses its actions and work on ecological or environmental issues. Greenpeace itself has a long history to become the large global non-governmental organization it is today. Greenpeace's head office is in Amsterdam and now has offices in nearly 41 countries, including India.

Greenpeace in India was founded in 2001 and focuses its campaigns on issues such as air pollution, industrial waste, coal and nuclear power plants, and forestry. The case of air pollution in India itself can be said to be one of the worst in the entire country. According to a report released by WHO in 2014, 13 out of 20 polluted cities are in India. The main sources that cause air pollution in India come from vehicle exhaust and the burning of solid fuels or biomass, as the main sources. The main source of air pollution contains very small and fine concentrations of particulate matter, namely PM2.5 and PM10. The particles are so fine they can enter the respiratory tract and penetrate the lungs. The impact caused by exposure to PM2.5 and PM10 is health problems such as lung cancer, respiratory infections, ischemic heart disease, to premature death or premature death experienced by pregnant women. In 2014, the death toll from pollution in India reached 1.24 million. One study entitled Burden of Disease Attributable to Major Air Pollution Sources in India states that if air pollution is not addressed immediately, the death rate from air pollution will increase. The study predicts the death toll will reach 1.7 million in 2020 and 3.6 million in 2050.

The Indian government itself has been trying to overcome the air pollution that occurs in the country. In 2015, it has issued the National Air Quality Index (NAQI) as a mitigation measure in overcoming air pollution. However, Greenpeace feels that the government has not been too serious in dealing with air pollution in its country. Therefore, as an organization that really cares about environmental issues around it, Greenpeace then took action by launching its campaign under the name Clean Air Nation Movement on 22 September 2015 which tried to pressure the government to immediately update NAQI and tackle air pollution as soon as possible.

There are three strategies used by Greenpeace in carrying out its actions, namely information politics, symbolic politics, and leverage politics. In the first strategy, namely information politics, Greenpeace uses the information they have, such as reports, articles, posters, and so on, which are published on their official website to invite and encourage the public to get involved in their actions. Greenpeace also uses social media to disseminate their information, such as through the Youtube, Twitter, or Facebook platforms. However, Greenpeace itself more often uses the Twitter platform in disseminating its information. On Twitter Greenpeace can write their opinions and views on an issue. In this case, Greenpeace used the hashtag #cleanairnation on Twitter to make it easier for the public to access

information about air pollution and Greenpeace activities related to it. Greenpeace's uniquely packaged activities or actions always get media attention, one of which is when Greenpeace climbed the Vashi bridge as one of their actions in the Clean Air Nation campaign. The coverage from the media is used by Greenpeace as one of their strategies in mobilizing the community to be involved in it.

For the strategy of symbolic politics, Greenpeace uses campaigns as well as actions in carrying out its strategy. Greenpeace has succeeded in using both symbols to raise the issue of air pollution in India. In this regard, Greenpeace launched their Clean Air Nation campaign. Then Greenpeace protested as part of their campaign. In carrying out this action, Greenpeace collaborated with several other community organizations which later became part of the large group #HelpDelhiBreathe. The group then performed its first action on January 17, 2016 in Jantar Mantar. In addition, Greenpeace also carried out other actions that attracted the attention of the public, one of which was climbing the Vashi Bridge in Mumbai. Thanks to the symbols he used to raise the issue of air pollution, which they then packaged as attractively as possible, Greenpeace was able to gain support and attention from other stronger parties.

The last strategy that Greenpeace uses is leverage politics. In running the Clean Air Nation campaign, Greenpeace managed to invite other community organizations which later formed the #HelpDelhiBreathe collaboration network. The community organization has the same goal as Greenpeace, which is to go to India with clean air. In addition, Greenpeace has also successfully lobbied and invited members of parliament to urge the government to immediately release a policy to tackle air pollution in India. Greenpeace was also successful in lobbying the Minister for the Environment and meeting to urge the MoEFCC to immediately release the policies they are working on in the near future. Greenpeace's lobbying power makes it easier for Greenpeace to press policy makers more quickly and directly

The government through the MoEFCC will finally launch the National Clean Air Program (NCAP) in April 2018 as a national strategy in overcoming air pollution. But in reality, the release of NCAP has been delayed until an undetermined time limit. This prompted Greenpeace together with other MPs and activists to write a letter to the MoEFCC Minister regarding further clarity on the release of NCAP. Although it had been delayed several times, the government through the MoEFCC Minister finally released the NCAP on January 10, 2019 as an air pollution mitigation measure. NCAP itself is a five-year action plan and makes 2019 its first year. The main goal of NCAP is to reduce PM<sub>2.5</sub> and PM<sub>10</sub> concentrations by 20-30% by 2024. In this program the government also increases the number of monitoring stations in all cities in India, including in rural areas. In addition the program also has action plans for the 102 non-attainment cities identified to implement mitigation actions under the NCAP and there will be a project monitoring committee at the state level with scientists and trained personnel. This program also requires each city and district to form sectoral working groups so that the program can run well and effectively.

When compared to the campaigns or actions that Greenpeace has carried out previously in India, Greenpeace still uses the strategy of symbolic politics and leverage politics. However, according to the author, what makes the difference is that now internet access is getting easier, so Greenpeace is also more aggressive in carrying out their online campaigns. In addition, Greenpeace is also getting easier to lobby and invite political actors at the national level, such as members of parliament to ministers. This shows that the power of Greenpeace has strengthened in recent years. Even though Greenpeace India is experiencing a lot of pressure from the community and also the government, especially regarding their funding, Greenpeace India is still able to mobilize the community to raise environmental issues to companies or governments that they perceive as negligent in

protecting the environment. It is this strength that has earned the Greenpeace campaign the support of the wider community, thus encouraging them to take other actions that can attract the attention of the government. That way, it will be easier for Greenpeace to lobby and convey its demands to the government.

## References

1. L. P. Karjaya, R. Satrio, and S. Suspiati, *J. Hub. Int.* **8**, (2019).
2. S. Riyanto and B. Winarno, *Int. J. Innov. Creat. Chang.* **11**, 69 (2020).
3. Health Effects Institute, *Heal. Eff. Institute.* 24 (2019).
4. K. Mathiesen, *Where is the world's most polluted city?*, *Guard.* (2015).
5. J. Burke, *Child health fears at the most polluted spot in the world's most polluted city*, *Guard.* (2015).
6. Reuters, *India tops global pollution deaths of 9 million a year: Study*, *Econ. Times* (2018).
7. *The Economic Times*, *Greenpeace launches 'clean air' campaign, seeks improved NAQI*, *Econ. Times* (2015).
8. Greenpeace India, *As India struggles to breathe, over 300 coal power plants are violating air pollution laws and MoEFCC does nothing*, *Www.Greenpeace.Org* (2015).
9. D. Lewis, *The Management of Non-Governmental Development Organizations: An Introduction* (Routledge, London, 2004).
10. S. Savitri, S. Wiranata, and S. Kawitri Resen, *J. Hub. Int.* **1**, 1 (2015).
11. A. Tsauro, *Perkembangan Non-Governmental Organization*, (2015).
12. Lingkar LSM, *Karakteristik LSM*, <http://Lingkarlsm.Com/Karakteristik-Lsm/>, (2015).
13. D. Mulyani, *Jom FISIP* **2**, 5 (2015).
14. Sasha-syaifani, *Jaringan Advokasi Transnasional Menurut Margaret Keck dan Kathryn Sikkink*, (2018).
15. M. E. Keck and K. Sikkink, *Int. Soc. Sci. J.* **51**, 89 (1999).
16. L. Myllyvirta, S. Dahiya, and N. Sivalingam, *Out of Sight: How Coal Burning Advances India's Air Pollution Crisis* (Greenpeace India, Bangalore, 2016).
17. Greenpeace India, *As India struggles to breathe, over 300 coal power plants are violating air pollution laws and MoEFCC does nothing*, *www.Greenpeace.Org* (2017).
18. U. Ifansasti, *The Mobilisation Cookbook* (Mobilisation Lab, 2016).
19. R. Kumar, *Help Delhi Breathe and the people-powered movement to clean Delhi's air*, *Mob Lab* (2018).
20. *India Today*, *Delhi wants concrete steps to help it breathe*, (2016).
21. R. Hasan, *10 Negara Penghasil Batu Bara Terbesar di Dunia, Ada Indonesia!*, *Oke Financ.* (2019).
22. Greenpeace India, *National Clean Air Programme (NCAP) Good Start But Needs Transparent Action*: Greenpeace India, *www.Greenpeace.Org* (2018).
23. N. Sivalingam, *The MoEFCC Has Spoken: A National Clean Air Programme for India*, *Greenpeace* (2015).
24. G. Saji, *Members of Parliament Urged Dr Harsh Vardhan to Notify National Clean Air Programme Without Further Delay*, *Greenpeace* (2018).
25. *The Economic Times*, *hawa badlo: Mobile app 'Hawa Badlo' launched to fight air*

pollution in Delhi, Econ. Times (2016).

26. G. Saji, National Clean Air Programme Only a Paper Tiger Without Time-bound Targets: Experts, Greenpeace (2018).

27. Ministry of Environment, Forest and Climate Change, Government launches National Clean Air Programme (NCAP), Gov. India 1 (2019).